



APPROVED JUNE 10, 2020

---

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION VIRTUAL BUSINESS MEETING  
May 13, 2020, ROOM CH-14

MINUTES

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Jim Haden (Chairperson)  
Ms. Kim Parati (Vice Chairperson)  
Ms. Jessica Hindman (2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson)  
Mr. Chris Barth  
Ms. Nichelle Bonaparte  
Mr. PJ Henningson  
Mr. Jim Jordan  
Ms. Christa Lineberger  
Mr. Chris Muryn  
Mr. John Phares  
Mr. Damon Rumsch  
Ms. Jill Walker

MEMBERS ABSENT: NONE

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Kristi Harpst, Administrator of the Historic District  
Ms. Candice Leite, Staff to the Historic District Commission  
Ms. Cindy Kochanek, Staff to the Historic District Commission  
Ms. Linda Keich, Clerk to the Historic District Commission  
Ms. Andrea Leslie-Fite, Senior Assistant City Attorney  
Ms. Candy Thomas, Court Reporter  
Ms. Jana Hartenstine  
Mr. Rusty Gibbs  
Ms. Panchali Sau  
Mr. Tim Finein

---

With a quorum present, Chairman Haden called the May WebEx Virtual Business Meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 10:05 am. Chairman Haden began the meeting by introducing the Staff, the Commissioners, and explaining the meeting's procedure. The Historic District Commission is a quasi-judicial body, no public hearings will be held during today's virtual meeting. The meeting agenda includes Consent items that require only a confirmation vote by the Commission. Staff will present a brief summary of the project. Chairman Haden will then ask if any member of the public wishes to speak on a Consent Agenda item. Members of the public that are present to speak on the Consent Agenda items must use the WebEx "raise your hand" tool to be recognized by the Chair. If any member of the public requests to speak or if a Commissioner asks for the project to be placed on the Regular Agenda for a full hearing, then the case will be moved to the next available regular Historic District Commission meeting date. Any Commissioner wishing to request the floor on a meeting topic will use the WebEx "raise your hand" tool to be recognized by Staff or the Chair. Commissioners are asked to announce, for the record, if one leaves or arrives during the meeting. Chairman Haden will do a round robin and ask each Commissioner individually if they have questions for staff or wish for the project to undergo a full hearing. The Commission will make a MOTION to affirm the Consent Agenda item or to move

the case to a future regular agenda for a full hearing. A majority vote of the Commission members present is required for a decision to be reached. Chairman Haden asked that everyone please mute your audio when not speaking, to use only one source of audio (computer OR phone), and do not place telephones on hold. Chairman Haden also instructed attendees to turn off or silent electronic devices and not to speak over the person talking.

Index of Addresses:

**CONSENT AGENDA**

HDCRMI 2020-00142, 1926 Ewing Avenue	Dilworth
HDCRMI 2020-00164, 629 Berkeley Avenue	Dilworth
HDCRMI 2020-00162, 1701 Merriman Avenue	Wilmore
HDCRMI 2020-00209, 412 E. Tremont Avenue	Dilworth
HDCRMI 2020-00213, 1843 Thomas Avenue	Plaza Midwood
HDCRMI 2020-00222, 415 Walnut Avenue	Wesley Heights

**PRE-APPLICATION PROJECT REVIEWS**

1730 Thomas Avenue – Accessory Structure Changes	Plaza Midwood
VanLandingham Townhomes – New Construction	Plaza Midwood

---

**CONSENT AGENDA**

---

**ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT MEETING:**

N/A

**APPLICATION: HDCRMI 2020-00142, 1926 EWING AVENUE – FENESTRATION CHANGES**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing structure is a one-story side-gabled cottage built c. 1930. Architectural features include Colonial Revival elements as visible in the in the 6/6 window configuration and the arched entry porch and gable eave returns. The lot size is approximately 57' x 178'. Adjacent structures are one- and two-story single-family houses.

**PROPOSAL:**

The proposed project includes changing the fenestration on an existing bump-out on the left elevation. The four existing small windows (one on the front elevation, two on the side elevation, and one on the rear elevation) will be changed to larger casement windows measuring approximately 28 ¾ x 48 ¾. The proposed windows are Jeld-Wen Sitaline wood casements with 5/8" putty glaze Simulated True Divided Lights (STDL) in a pattern to coordinate with the existing house. All trim will be wood with dimensions and details to match existing.

But for the location of the proposed window changes (front elevation and visible side elevation), the project would otherwise be eligible for Administrative approval. The location of the window changes is what requires full Commission review.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for Windows, 4.12-4.14.
2. Per 10.4.1 of the Rules for Procedure, staff recommends Approval of the window changes for meeting all Guidelines and that this item be heard as a Consent Agenda item.
3. If requested by a Commission member, or if an interested party has signed up to speak in opposition, then the HDC shall open the application for a full hearing.

**SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

No one accepted Mr. Haden’s invitation to speak either for or against this application.

**MOTION: APPROVED**

**1<sup>st</sup>: HINDMAN**

**2<sup>nd</sup>: JORDAN**

Ms. Hindman moved to approve this consent agenda item as drawn.

**VOTE:** 12/0

**AYES:** BARTH, BONAPARTE, HADEN, HENNINGSON, HINDMAN, JORDAN, LINEBERGER, MURYN, PARATI, PHARES, RUMSCH, WALKER

**NAYS:** NONE

**DECISION:**

CONSENT AGENDA ITEM FOR FENESTRATION CHANGES APPROVED.

---

**ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT MEETING:**

MR. PHARES RECUSED HIMSELF FROM THE NEXT APPLICATION

**APPLICATION: HDCRMI 2020-00164, 629 BERKELEY AVENUE – ADDITION**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing building is a 1.5 story Tudor Cottage constructed in 1946. Architectural features include an arched entry, exterior chimney on the front elevation, 8/8 double-hung wood windows and unpainted brick.

**PROPOSAL:**

The proposal is changing the one-story screened side porch on the right elevation into heated space. On the left elevation toward the rear is a brick entry stair that is already enclosed, and the project includes updating the enclosure to match the proposed design of the side porch. Existing brick foundations and roofs to remain, only proposed changes are to the exterior walls. Proposed materials are traditional with double-hung wood windows in a 6/6 pattern to match existing.

The project is similar to a recent Commission approval which changed one-story side screen porch into a four-seasons room on a larger Dutch Colonial at 2015 Dilworth Road East.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for porches, 4.8, #2, 5, and 6, and the Secretary of the Interiors Standards, page 2.5, with details about the final window selection, including muntin size and profile, be submitted to staff for a final review.
2. Per 10.4.1 of the Rules for Procedure, staff recommends Approval of the project for meeting the Guidelines and that this item be heard as a Consent Agenda item, with details about the final window selection, including muntin size and profile, be submitted to staff for a final review.
3. If requested by a Commission member, or if an interested party has signed up to speak in opposition, then the HDC shall open the application for a full hearing.

**SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

No one accepted Mr. Haden’s invitation to speak either for or against this application.

**MOTION: REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA**

**1<sup>st</sup>: RUMSCH**

**2<sup>nd</sup>: PARATI**

Mr. Rumsch moved that this item be remove from the Consent Agenda and for it to be placed on a future Full Commission Meeting Agenda.

**VOTE:** 11/0

**AYES:** BARTH, BONAPARTE, HADEN, HENNINGSON, HINDMAN, JORDAN, LINEBERGER, MURYN, PARATI, RUMSCH, WALKER

**NAYS:** NONE

**DECISION:**

CONSENT AGENDA ITEM FOR ADDITION REMOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA AND WILL BE PLACED ON A FUTURE FULL COMMISSION MEETING AGENDA.

---

**ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT MEETING:**

MR. PHARES RETURNED TO THE MEETING FOR THE NEXT APPLICATION.

**APPLICATION: HDCRMI 2020-00162, 1701 MERRIMAN AVENUE – REAR ADDITION**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing structure is a one-story side-gabled cottage built c. 1930. Architectural features include a partial width front porch with a front gable roof supported by brick piers and wood columns, 6/6 double-hung wood windows, and German-lap siding with mitered corners. The lot size is approximately 68' x 176'. Adjacent structures are one- and two-story single-family and multi-family buildings.

**PROPOSAL:**

The proposed project is a rear addition. All materials will match existing traditional features – siding, trim, vents. New windows proposed to be aluminum clad wood with Simulated True Divided Lights (STDL) in a 6/6 pattern to match existing. The fence is reviewable at the staff level.

But for the corner lot location of 1701 Merriman Avenue, the project would be reviewable at the staff level, and due to the visibility of the project requires full Commission approval.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for Additions, 7.2 and New Construction, Chapter 6, with staff to work with the applicant on the size and location of the gable end, 6-pane casement window on the rear elevation.
2. Per 10.4.1 of the Rules for Procedure, staff recommends Approval of the rear addition for meeting all Guidelines and that this item be heard as a Consent Agenda item, with staff to work with the applicant on the size and location of the gable end, 6-pane casement window on the rear elevation.
3. If requested by a Commission member, or if an interested party has signed up to speak in opposition, then the HDC shall open the application for a full hearing.

**SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

No one accepted Mr. Haden's invitation to speak either for or against this application.

**MOTION: REMOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA**

**1<sup>st</sup>: N/A**

**2<sup>nd</sup>: N/A**

Mr. Rumsch requested this item be remove from the Consent Agenda and for it to be placed on a future Full Commission Meeting Agenda.

**VOTE:** NO VOTE NEEDED

**AYES:** N/A

**NAYS:** N/A

**DECISION:**

CONSENT AGENDA ITEM FOR REAR ADDITION REMOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA AND WILL BE PLACED ON A FUTURE FULL COMMISSION MEETING AGENDA.

---

**ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT MEETING:**

N/A

**APPLICATION: HDCRMI 2020-00209, 412 EAST TREMONT AVENUE – REAR ADDITION**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing structure is a 1.5 story bungalow-built c. 1925. Architectural features include a front clipped gable, German lap siding, full-width shed porch with replacement brick piers and tapered columns, brackets, exposed rafter tails, and 4/1 double-hung wood windows. The lot size is approximately 50' x 150'. Adjacent structures are one- and two-story single-family and multi-family buildings.

**PROPOSAL:**

The proposed project is a rear addition. All materials will match existing traditional features – siding, trim, vents. New windows proposed to be aluminum clad wood with Simulated True Divided Lights (STDL) in a 6/6 pattern to match existing.

The slight bump-out on the right elevation makes the addition wider than the original house, which requires Commission review, per Additions, page 7.2 #7.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

1. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for Additions, 7.2 and New Construction, Chapter 6.
2. Per 10.4.1 of the Rules for Procedure, staff recommends Approval of the rear addition for meeting all Guidelines and that this item be heard as a Consent Agenda item.
3. If requested by a Commission member, or if an interested party has signed up to speak in opposition, then the HDC shall open the application for a full hearing.

**SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

No one accepted Mr. Haden's invitation to speak either for or against this application.

**MOTION: APPROVED**

**1<sup>st</sup>: PARATI**

**2<sup>nd</sup>: HINDMAN**

Ms. Parati moved to approve this consent agenda item as drawn.

**VOTE:** 12/0

**AYES:** BARTH, BONAPARTE, HADEN, HENNINGSON, HINDMAN, JORDAN, LINEBERGER, MURYN, PARATI, PHARES, RUMSCH, WALKER

**NAYS:** NONE

**DECISION:**

CONSENT AGENDA ITEM FOR REAR ADDITION APPROVED.

---

**ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT MEETING:**

MS. LINEBERGER RECUSED HERSELF FROM THE NEXT APPLICATION.

**APPLICATION: HDCRMI 2020-00213, 1843 THOMAS AVENUE -WINDOW & DOOR CHANGES**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing structure is a one-story house with Tudor Revival elements constructed in 1930. Exterior finish is stucco. Lot size is approximately 50' x 150'. Adjacent structures are 1, 1.5, and 2 story single-family and multi-family buildings.

**PROPOSAL:**

The project is changes to doors and windows on the front right and rear elevations. On the front elevation the replacement front door will be removed, and a new wood front door will be installed. A secondary entry door off the front concrete stoop (see left elevation) will be removed and replaced with a new window with header height and design to match existing. On the right elevation a side exterior door and stairs will be removed, and a new window will be installed to match existing. On the rear elevation a replacement door will be removed, and a new wood entry door

will be installed. All windows to be double-hung wood and where used, muntins will be Simulated True Divided Light (STDL) in a 4/1 pattern to match existing.

Note: All proposed changes were previously approved by the Commission as part of a larger scope of work that included a rear addition under application number HDCRMI-2018-00025 on February 14, 2018. Final permit-ready construction drawings were not submitted to staff and a COA was never issued.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

4. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for Windows and Doors and these changes were part of a previous Commission approved project with a larger scope of work that has since expired.
5. Per 10.4.1 of the Rules for Procedure, staff recommends Approval of the door and window changes for meeting all Guidelines and because the project was previously approved but has since expired, and that this item be heard as a Consent Agenda item.
6. If requested by a Commission member, or if an interested party has signed up to speak in opposition, then the HDC shall open the application for a full hearing.

**SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

No one accepted Mr. Haden’s invitation to speak either for or against this application.

**MOTION: APPROVED**

**1<sup>st</sup>: PHARES**

**2<sup>nd</sup>: RUMSCH**

Mr. Phares moved to approve this consent agenda item as drawn.

**VOTE:** 11/0

**AYES:** BARTH, BONAPARTE, HADEN, HENNINGSON, HINDMAN, JORDAN, MURYN, PARATI, PHARES, RUMSCH, WALKER

**NAYS:** NONE

**DECISION:**

CONSENT AGENDA ITEM FOR WINDOW & DOOR CHANGES APPROVED.

---

**ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT MEETING:**

MS. LINEBERGER RETURNED TO THE MEETING FOR THE NEXT APPLICATION.

**APPLICATION: HDCRMI 2020-00222, 415 WALNUT AVENUE – REAR ADDITION**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing structure is a one-story Bungalow style house constructed in 1926 with a front porch that continues the left side. Other features include a hipped roof, wood siding, a hipped front dormer, brick chimney, side gables, and paired windows on the front. A one-story rear addition was added c. 2007/2008.

**PROPOSAL:**

The project is a one-story addition to the left elevation and the rear. The rear addition is not visible from the street, will tie in below the existing ridge, and will measure approximately 16’ x 17’-4”. The addition to the left elevation will be located behind an existing wrap-around front porch and is no taller than the existing house. The addition is +/- 8’ in width and will extend 3’ past the front porch. No changes to the front of the house, including the front porch and original front dormer. New materials are wood siding and trim to match existing. New roof and window trim details will match the house. No impacts to mature canopy trees. **The project was previously approved by the Commission on February 13, 2019 under case number HDCRMI-2018-00702. The COA has expired and the applicant is requesting re-affirmation of the previous approval, with minor changes to fenestration on the left and rear elevation.**

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for Additions, 7.2 and New Construction, Chapter 6, and except for minor fenestration changes, the overall project is unchanged from the plans previously presented to and approved by the Commission on February 13, 2019.
2. Per 10.4.1 of the Rules for Procedure, staff recommends Approval of the rear addition for meeting all Guidelines and that this item be heard as a Consent Agenda item, because except for minor fenestration changes the overall project is unchanged from the plans previously presented to and approved by the Commission on February 13, 2019.
3. If requested by a Commission member, or if an interested party has signed up to speak in opposition, then the HDC shall open the application for a full hearing.

**SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

No one accepted Mr. Haden’s invitation to speak either for or against this application.

**MOTION: APPROVED**

**1<sup>st</sup>: RUMSCH 2<sup>nd</sup>: PHARES**

Mr. Rumsch moved to approve this consent agenda item as drawn.

**VOTE:** 12/0

**AYES:** BARTH, BONAPARTE, HADEN, HENNINGSON, HINDMAN, JORDAN, LINEBERGER  
MURYN, PARATI, PHARES, RUMSCH, WALKER

**NAYS:** NONE

**DECISION:**

CONSENT AGENDA ITEM FOR REAR ADDITION APPROVED.

---

**PRE-APPLICATION PROJECT REVIEW**

---

**1. 1730 THOMAS AVENUE, ACCESSORY STRUCTURE**

Ms. Hartenstine gave a presentation on the design of a proposed Addition to an existing Accessory Structure to receive feedback from the Commission.

**2. VANLANDINGHAM TOWNHOMES, NEW CONSTRUCTION**

Mr. Rusty Gibbs, Panchali Sau, Tim Finein gave a presentation on the design of proposed townhomes to receive feedback from the Commission.

---

**COMMISSION VACANCIES**

---

Mr. Rumsch moved that incumbent Ms. Jessica Hindman, who holds an At-large seat, be recommended for a change of status to the Business Owner of Dilworth seat. Mr. Phares seconded, and the vote was unanimous.

Ms. Parati moved to recommend Phillip Goodwin to City Council for appointment to the At-Large seat currently held by Ms. Jessica Hindman. Ms. Walker seconded, and the vote was unanimous.

---

Mr. Henningson moved to approve the March 11, 2020, Historic District Commission Meeting minutes, Ms. Lineberger seconded, and the vote was unanimous.

Mr. Haden Adjourned the meeting at 12:15 PM.